The Cochin Joint Land Registration Bill.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—I move that the Cochin Joint Land Registration Bill, as amended by the Council, be passed.

Rao Sahib Mr. T. V. Kasturi Ranga Ayyar.—Yes.

Mr. K. Sankaran Nambudiri.—I second it.

President.—The question before the House is that "the Cochin Joint Land Registration Bill" as amended be passed at to-day's meeting.

The motion was put to vote and carried.

The Banker's Books Evidence Bill.

Mr. C. A. Kunjunni Raja.—I move that the Banker's Books Evidence Bill as amended be taken up and passed.

Mr. K. Sankaran Nambudiri.—I second it.

President.—The question before the House is that the Banker's Books Evidence Bill, as amended by the Council, be taken up and passed.

The motion was put to vote and carried.

Statement laid on the table.

Mr. K. Krishna Pisharodi.—Sir, under Rule 52 of the Legislative Council Rules, I beg to place on the table the following statement of the expenditure authorised by the Government under section 16 (9) of the Legislative Council Regulation VIII of 1098.

Item	Amount	Remarks
1. Land Revenue B "Law Charges"	Rs. 250	There was not sufficient balance available under the allotment sanctioned under "Law charges" for the year, and as expenditure on account of a large number of pending suits, suits sanctioned to be filed and decrees pending execution, had to be incurred urgently, an additional allotment of Rs. 250 was sanctioned for the purpose.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I shall not take up the time of this House in diving deep into the institutions of England and America or Germany. I shall confine myself to a constructive idea for our own State. Sir, the Ernakulam General Hospital was a small institution—an insignificant one—when His Highness the Ex-Raja ascended the *musnad*. At that time, Sir, the Civil Surgeon attached to the Municipal Hospital at British Cochin was the Chief Medical Advisor of the State. It was then thought to bring this institution into popularity and to have it for the greater use of the people, and a full-timed officer (Dr. Coombes) was imported from England, the choice being left to the Secretary of State for India. Sir, it is within living memory how that institution grew into the very first-rate institution in Southern India, of course, after Madras. There is not a single institution in Southern India which can compare with our General Hospital, and to-day, thanks to the labours of two successive Diwans like Messrs. Bhore and Vijayaraghavacharya, who gave liberal funds for the uplift of that institution, and thanks to the labours of Dr. Coombes and Dr. Rao, we have one of the first-rate institutions in Southern India. Now, take Dr. Verghese. He has also expanded it and added the X-Ray Installation in the Hospital. Travancore which is a bigger State with greater resources is now only thinking of putting up an installation of X-Ray in their Hospital. We have gone in advance of them. So I say we have every right to compliment ourselves upon our medical institutions, and let us see, Sir, what that will lead us to. I say I am intimately connected with the Hospital, and I have not only visited it but also know the working of it from day to day for the last 17 years—far more intimately connected than the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu. I know that all who come there, rich and poor alike, are well-treated by all the officers concerned. If there are defects, and if they are pointed out to the officers, they are always found willing to correct them.

President.—Who go there in larger numbers, the rich or the poor?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—All sick people go there, Sir.

President.—That is no answer to my question.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The Government must answer that question. I only know that sick people go there, and no classification is made there. Sir, this much I can say, that many rich people also go to the Hospital attracted by the convenience that the institution can offer them when they are sick. People may have to undergo an operation, and they may have more facilities

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

in the Hospitals, and the people who want such conveniences go there. That is why I advocated, during the last budget session, the introduction of paying wards, so that we may have greater conveniences available for the rich people and ask those people to pay for them. I will come to that point later on. Now, let me develop my argument. I would quote here in a few words the whole argument of the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu. His argument comes to this, that no other legislature has introduced a Bill of the character, because they are fully conscious of the difficulties that confront them. I say that medical relief of the kind is being given in far advanced countries like England and even on the Continent. He says there is no such thing in England, and he wants to rivet our attention upon the great naval and military Hospitals which have nothing to do with the point at issue. The naval and military Hospitals run by the Government are part of the navy and the army. The army consists of a large number of people, and the navy has got any number of blue jackets who get sick. They have got to be treated and taken care of, while they are sick, and not while they are well. Those institutions cannot be compared with the civil institutions. The civil institutions in England, thanks to the development of the self-governing instinct in the British people, have become self-governing institutions, and what is there, if Cochin also asks for similar self-governing institutions and asks the Government to encourage the growth of such institutions? I can see nothing wrong in it. It may be well said that we have no such well-organised social structures here, and that the people there are richer and more powerful with greater capacity for organisation. Have you tested us? Have you given us an opportunity to show of what metal the people of Cochin are made of? Have you found any officer that has been recruited from the people of Cochin inefficent in the discharge of his duties in connection with his office? When such men as officers are put into the bureaucratic holes, still they shine there. Have you tested our capacity? Is not the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu here the embodiment and repository of all kinds of knowledge in the State? Is he not a man of the State who has been in the service of the State, and who has shed lustre upon the State service? Therefore, hand over these institutions to us, give us the reins of popular government, and we will show of what metal we are made of. You deny us an opportunity and condemn us. That is most unfair. I challenge any Member sitting on the Government benches opposing this Bill to state that the people of Cochin are not advanced enough to run a hospital efficiently. Who is

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

more interested in the welfare of a Hospital, the Government or the people? The Government is interested because of the people, and the people are interested because of themselves. And what is the Government? We have often heard, times without number, the Government telling us "Please don't tell us that the Government have not at heart the interests of the people, and that we are not identifying ourselves with the people." I take it that the Government are identifying themselves with the people. Now, let us see to what we are led to. Let us see the words uttered by His Highness at the inaugural session of this House. His Highness' words were "I want to associate my people in an increasing measure with the Government of the State". Very good. I will give here the definition of the word "Government" as definend by the Cochin Government in one of the Regulations. If the Cochin Government is unable to do that, I will show that I am able to do it. The word "Government" means "Executive officers who administer the executive government in the territory of Cochin". That is the definition given in Regulation VIII of 1084, III of 1090, VIII of 1093, XI of 1098 and II of 1099. Now, let us see. We are asking you to associate us with that portion of the executive government which handles the medical institutions. What is the idea? The idea is simply this. The idea is not to upset the present arrangements. The duties of the medical men have been defined by the Medical Officer as connected with the courts, as connected with the service and several other duties which are not the duties of prescribing medicine, etc. Now, is it very difficult that, if these honorary surgeons or physicians are attached to the hospital, that their duties cannot be defined? We can define them. This is what would happen. We are asking for the idea of association of the people with that branch of the Government's activities—namely, giving help to the sick. Now, what is the other, i. e., the idea of the Board? We say, for the benefit of the people, till our efficiency is proved, let the Government nominate half the members of the Board, and let the Chief Medical Officer advise them. Give us a chance of learning this work so as to help the growth of self-governing institutions in our State. Do you deny it? Is it not essential for us in future to march towards constitutional government in the Cochin State? If you deny us this opportunity, where and how are we to learn this work?

Let us march slowly. Give us one by one. What is the idea prevailing in British India? They have got advisory councils for education and medicine. They have got advisors for medicine. Now, Sir, they have got ministers to represent

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

departments who have parliamentary secretaries inside the council, and these secretaries get considerable training of the routine of administration. The minister who is in charge of medicine at present is Dr. Subbarayan. Am I to take the statement from the Chief Medical Officer that an amateur is unable to administer the department? Can I not say that the Diwans of Cochin have been amateurs, as far as medicine is concerned, and were they not carrying on efficiently the administration of that department as well? Why not a body of people elected by the municipalities and local authorities who are interested in these institutions along with the Government—say that a body elected by them and the Government—together administer the department as efficiently as it is now being administered by a single bureaucratic Diwan sitting over the head of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer? I fail to see any force in the arguments at all. All the rhetoric goes, if it is analysed properly. Unite and drop prejudice out of the motion, and let a Select Committee bring in a good measure. That is what I would ask. I am not standing here for objects and reasons. I paid the highest compliments to the efficiency of the administration of medicine in our State, and I say, let us all put our heads together in time to accord the honest sentiment uttered by His Highness the Maharaja of Cochin during the inauguration ceremony of the Cochin Legislative Council.

His Highness states " I hope that my officers and the representatives of the people will work in unison with mutual trust, sympathy and co-operation for the betterment of the people of Cochin."

We have no other idea than the betterment of the people of Cochin. We want you to give us a chance, a half-chance, so that we may do the best that we can for the people. I am at one with the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer in that there should be no differentiation of the sheep from the goats, and the sheep shall not be sheared either. When they are in the hospital, I can suggest beautiful methods by which these honorary officers can get a remuneration or other graduated scale of payments. Out of the funds paid by the people on a graduated scale based on incomes, a portion may be given to the honorary officers who attend the hospital.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—The cat is out of the bag. Do honorary men get pay?

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The cat is not out of the bag. Honorary men get honorariums. Give it as honorariums, because there can be no legalised fee for doing honorary work.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

I suppose I will not be interrupted. I have got just a few minutes, and I have finished. There is the graduated scale of payment even in ordinary wards. A rich patient may come. He may say "I would like honorary surgeon so and so to attend upon me." He may charge his fees in the hospital. That is legal. That would be proper. There would be no room for corruption. All these matters can be thrashed out and brought out in good order beautifully in a Select Committee. There is nothing to prevent a fresh Bill, coming from the Select Committee in which the Government can also put their heads, with the people's representatives together. Those who are anxious will put their heads together, and then we can evolve something which will be acceptable to the House. If it is not acceptable to the House, we will vote against it. The heavens are not going to come down by accepting the principle of the Bill, and the department is not going to be disorganised. Certainly not. Let me ask one thing more. Whether the Board administer the Hospitals or the Government administer the Hospitals on, what will the efficiency of the Hospitals depend? It will depend upon the men in charge of the actual working of the Hospitals. Propositions will go before the Diwans, and propositions will go before the Boards. It is now sent to the decision of the Diwan. With a Board the Diwan will put his approval on their recommendations and it wlll go as an order through the Board to the Hospital to be carried out. What is there in evolving such a system? I fail, therefore, to see any valid reason for the opposition of the Bill. All the reasons against I have analysed, and they fall to the ground, and all of them can be successfully met. The Bill, as it now stands, is unhappily worded. That has been conceded by the Member, and in the Select Committee, with the help of the Government, with the help of their experience and with the help of the department, we will be able to amend every provision into proper provisions, so that what we want the Government to do is to give us a chance to bring a self-governing institution in the State as a preliminary step, so that we may understand how Government Departments are administered. With these words I support the Bill to be introduced in this House.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.--It is with considerable anxiety and a sense of heaviness of heart that I rise to oppose the consideration of this Bill. The earnestness of the mover and his well-meaning desire to improve the lot of the private medical practitioners of the State are in themselves strong arguments for the passage of this Bill. But, Sir, they cannot be taken to be conclusive arguments. The mover has asked us to keep an

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

open mind with regard to this Bill, and that is also my prayer. Irrespective of party considerations, irrespective of communal considerations, and irrespective of the considerations of the men in service and those outside, let us keep an open mind and approach the question from the point of view of the poor tax-payer. For, who is to be benefited by medical relief in the State? Neither the salaried medical officers nor the honorary surgeons who are to work in the Hospitals hereafter, if the Bill is passed; but the poor tax-payer. Sir, I have been in this Council for well-nigh 2 years, and I believe I have never given any occasion for any one to think that I am against a democratic movements. I have been in the forefront of popular movements, and it may be misunderstood why, in regard to such a popular measure as this—popular apparently—I am in the opposition. Therefore, Sir, I crave your indulgence to give me a little more time than what I am entitled to under the rules, so that I may explain my position and examine fully the Objects and Reasons of the Bill. There is no necessity for a change, if that change does us no good. We have a system of medicine at present under which, as certified to by the Member for the Jews who lives very near the General Hospital premises, we are getting the most efficient medical relief in South India, barring Madras. Now, Sir, where is the necessity for a change? That is my question. Two points have to be first made out when a change is contemplated. Firstly, under the prevailing system there are several defects, so that a change becomes necessary. The second point is that, if the change suggested is brought about, there will be a better state of affairs prevailing thereafter. These two have to be made out. I may here refer to Rule 30 of the Legislative Council Rules. That lays down that, when a Bill is sent up, a full statement of the Objects and Reasons must be sent along with it. That full statement of Objects and Reasons must be the justification for the Bill. Sir, we have got a full statement, and I am justified in presuming that the Member has obeyed the injunctions of the law. He has sent up a full statement of Objects and Reasons. Let me examine the statement of the Objects and Reasons, and if the statement given by the Member is groundless, then there is absolutely nothing in this Bill for this House to consider. No legislation is to be lightly undertaken. No change, however revolutionary or small, is to be made as easily as we are now asked to make. The time of the House is a valuable thing. The time of the Government is much more valuable. And the people's money that is being spent when we come and sit here is also a great consideration.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Sir, when such a Bill as this has to be considered by the House, there must be something in it which commends it to the acceptance of the House, and that something we can find out only from the Objects and Reasons of the Bill. It is for the mover to deal with the Objects and Reasons and make out that his reasons are cogent, and that the object is laudable and practicable. Has he done so? Has he resorted at any time to the Objects and Reasons? He has not. The Bill, therefore, stands self-condemned. The mover of the Bill who advertised the Bill more than a year ago in this very Hall has not referred at all to the Objects and Reasons with which he came before the House. Upon what, then, does the Bill stand? It stands not upon the Objects and Reasons but upon the honorary system, the principle of which is accepted by the Government. The mover said that the principle involved in the Bill is the honorary system. The Government accepts it. Should we support this Bill? There is no necessity for it.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—That is not the principle. That is not the basis. Please read the Bill.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—As I see from the Objects and Reasons, the complaint is generally against medical relief in the State. When we come to the Bill, it is confined to the Hospitals of Trichur and Ernakulam. Now, Sir, we have heard from the Member for the Jews that the Hospital at Ernakulam is one of the most efficient, and I think the Member for the Jews himself has testified that the Hospital at Trichur is equally efficient, and the Member for Trichur will also bear the statement out. Where, then, is the necessity for a change? The Hospitals at Trichur and Ernakulam are proposed by the Bill to be handed over to a Board for more efficient management, because, according to the Objects and Reasons, they are now working unsatisfactorily. But a strong supporter of the Bill, the Member for the Jews, tells us that they are some of the most efficient hospitals in South India. Where, then, is the justification for the Bill? Is there any Member who supports the Bill who can tell me what is the justification, taking the Objects and Reasons of the Bill as genuine Objects and Reasons?

Now, Sir, I will come to the detailed consideration of the Objects and Reasons. The first is sacrifice of the interests of the poor for the sake of the rich. A very large accusation it is, but it has not been made out. It is for the mover to give concrete instances where the interests of the poor have been sacrificed for the interests of the rich. Has he cited one instance? In 1101 more than 5 lakhs of people have been treated in the Hospitals

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of the State. Did he cite one instance in which the interests of the poor were sacrificed for those of the rich?

President.—Five lakhs of people in all the Hospitals together?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Yes, Sir. The attack is against the whole medical relief. The mover has neither taken pains nor cared to bring before us a few concrete instances. Not even one. And he wants the House to believe that the interests of the poor are sacrificed for those of the rich—a most unjustifiable statement, a statement which ought not have been made by a responsible Member of this House. For, when a Member makes a statement, he is responsible for it. Is there any reason given? Is there any instance given? When is he going to give instances? Should we not meet it? If he had any instances to cite, the time was when he moved for the consideration of the Bill. He was silent. He did not even refer to it. Whatever that be the rich and the poor are equal citizens of the State. They are both entitled to medical relief. The man in charge of the Hospital cannot turn out the rich, unless he is authorised to do so. Where is the justification in adopting that course? The rich man and the poor man pay taxes. You cannot turn out the rich. You cannot, when the ailing man comes for treatment, ask him to state his income. Which is the first consideration, asking him whether he is rich or poor or diagnosing his disease and curing him? The Member for Irinjalakkuda wants that the first consideration should always be a disputation. "Are you rich, are you poor? If you are rich, get out. If you are poor, come in".

Mr. A. B. Salem.—No disputation is necessary for these things. In the Madras Hospital there is a graduated scale, and it is put down—diet so much, income so much, etc. When he gets out he gets, a small bill according to his income. The system does not work by asking the patient at the door and picking a dispute. I am only correcting the Hon'ble Member.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—It has been solved by the Member for the Jews himself when he said about the paying wards. That difficulty is easily solved, and we have no necessity for this Bill. Sir, yesterday you asked the question "Are all these men that attend the Hospital rich or poor"? Now, Sir, we have got the Voters' List for the Legislative Council, and the number of voters is about 16 thousand, mostly people who pay a tax of Rs. 10 or more. Is a man who pays a tax of Rs. 10 rich? And the patients who attend the Hospitals—are they all poor or rich? The presumption is that they are poor. The majority are poor. Of course, no case having been made out by the mover who should

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

make it out with certainty, you should take it that all are poor and that the rich had gone there, except perhaps the Member for Jews and the Member for Mulakunnattukavu, both of whom admitted that they had gone there.

Then, again, it is said we are converting our public hospitals into nursing homes. Has any instance been cited? It is a mere statement. It should be given the value of a mere statement and not the statement of a fact.

Want of inducement on the part of the salaried staff to improve their medical efficiency is another charge. Is it because that their maintenance is guaranteed that they should be idle or is maintenance an incentive to hard work? We have heard of cases where men have been helped by giving them something to maintain themselves, so that they may do useful work. Even if these honorary men who are working outside are allowed in as honorary men, would not the same difficulty arise? Then, again, Sir, is this statement correct, that there is want of sufficient inducement for the medical staff to improve their medical efficiency? I would think the Member for Irinjalakkuda does not, perhaps, know that during the last ten years 8 men from the medical service have gone to England with their own funds to qualify themselves with English training. Is there not a desire on the part of the salaried medical men to improve their knowledge? Is not the statement an absolute untruth? Does the Member for Irinjalakkuda come before this House with a statement which cannot stand for a moment any scrutiny? I do not think it is necessary for me to read out the names of those who have gone and returned. They are amidst us. Whether the man be in service or outside the service, much depends upon his aptitude for the work. He will work, if he has the aptitude for work. We have heard of lawyers starving for a dozen years or more, and finally becoming leaders of the Bar. How do they become so? When they do not get money, if they are not appointed as Sirkar Vakils, do they sit idle? They try to improve their knowledge, so that they can be better off than those who are better placed.

Then, there is the accusation of unnecessary waste of public funds. The waste of public funds would have been enough! There cannot be any unnecessary waste. Where is it wasted? We have several Hospitals, and the only Hospitals that are covered by the Bill are the Hospitals of Trichur and Ernakulam, and even there under this system we have to appoint a few men who are paid, and the Secretary certainly will have to be paid. Then, Sir, where is the saving? I may ask one question. We have a Hospital at Kuriarkutti. Would any one of these medi-

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

cal men working outside the service go to Kuriarkutti as an honorary worker? Would any one go to that blessed place, Kutiran and work there? There must be one there. Should not the people there also be treated? Would any one go to Nanniode and such outlying villages and set up themselves there? There they can't get any practice. Would any of these medical men who are agitating for the passing of the Bill give an undertaking that they will go to such and such outlying villages? The Member for Irinjalakkuda referred to rural dispensaries. If the appointments were to be merely honorary, no one would have gone there.

Mr. A. B Salem.—What about Pattikkad?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The man there is to be paid. Otherwise nobody will go there. I admit there is a charge that the salaried medical men are, occasionally or very often as the case may be, putting some patients to difficulties, and if there is any, it is for the Government to look into it and cure the defect.

Then, Sir, the last point of attack is want of efficiency in the administration of the Hospitals. Now, since reference has been made in the Bill to only two hospitals in the State, Trichur and Ernakulam, I take it that this want of efficiency in the administration of the hospitals only refers to these two. If a Bill were brought to improve medical relief, to improve the administration of hospitals in the State, the hospitals that should be taken first must be those hospitals that are worse managed, and the names given are Ernakulam and Trichur. Sir, these supporters of the Bill said that these hospitals are some of the best managed hospitals. Can we blow hot and cold in the same breath?

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Certainly not.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Is it in this manner that we should try to pass a Bill in this House? Are these the arguments for the passage of the Bill? Are not these gentlemen ashamed to bring a Bill with this sort of arguments?

President.—"Ashamed" is an unparliamentary expression.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I withdraw the word. They could have used the arguments advanced by the Member for the Jews. He conceded that the Government administration of the hospital is efficient, and he wants self-government to come in. I agree. But there are other difficulties which I have to point out. Now, Sir, there is one hospital of the State which is managed on the same lines as is contemplated in this Bill, that is the Cheruvirutti hospital. This Ayurvedic Hospital is managed by a Board. Is this Hospital more efficiently managed than any of the Hospitals of the State?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Better managed.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I know that, Sir.

President.—They now want the Government to take it up.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Here the people want to hand over the hospitals to them.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The reason of asking the hospitals to be handed over to us is that it is the tax-payer's money that is wasted. We say "give us the money and give us the hospitals."

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The Cheruvirutti hospital is not better managed. I am not denying that it may be very well managed. But it is not better managed than the hospitals of our State. Is there any honorary system? The men there are paid. This is only one of the instances we obtain in the State of a hospital based on a system contemplated by this Bill. We do not find the honorary system prevailing there, and those men want the Government to take it up. Sir, I have no quarrel with the honorary system. I will be glad to support it. The Government would do best to take in as many honorary men as possible. But that is not the basis of the Bill. This Bill is intended to get into the hands of Boards the hospitals in the State, one Board for each Hospital. There is to be no connection between the several hospitals of the State. Each hospital in the State will be an independent unit. There will be one Board for each hospital. This Bill is intended to hand over the management of each hospital to a Board. They are to get the money from the Government. They are to spend as they like. The Government are to nominate some men. But is there a guarantee that the money will be well spent? A few men nominated by the Government cannot guarantee that the money will be well spent.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—What about municipalities?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I am coming to municipalities. I have not forgotten. Now, Sir, if it is intended to popularise the Government, we are to work at the constitution, at the fountain head, and get the Government to be more popular and then control the use of the purse. This is what is done elsewhere. Get control of the purse. Here you don't want to get the control of the purse. You want to get the control of the hospitals. That should be the move and not going for these detached things.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Try to improve the constitution.

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Are you not ambitious?

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I am very ambitious, but I am not so foolish. If you want self-governing institutions, you attempt

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

to popularise the Government. That is the remedy and not to try to get detached hospitals at Pattikad, Nanniode, &c., into the hands of Boards. That is not real popularising. That is not bringing into existence self-governing institutions in the State. Now, Sir, there is another statement that in Cochin at present there are conditions existing which are necessary for the successful working of the hospitals as is contemplated in the Bill. The only condition mentioned was the existence of medical practitioners. No other conditions were mentioned. The Member for the Jews said that others will be attracted. But the Bill does not want others to be attracted, and the principle is to exclude others. We want none but our own men. The mover says conditions are obtained in Cochin. The Member for the Jews says others will be attracted from outside. Thus there is contradiction between two apostles of the Bill. The Member for Trippunittura says that this is a civilized country: I have several doubts to be cleared in regard to this. Is it a civilized country in which this Bill can work where the service is fully manned by a few classes of the people? Is it a civilized country where the cry for better representation is quite unheeded and is opposed by a few classes? Is it a civilized country where an extensive portion of Government roads are closed to more than sixty per cent of His Highness' subjects?

President.—That is not a true statement.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—It was voiced forth in this House that some parts were closed and preserved for a few classes of the people of the State.

President.—Only half-a-mile of 500 miles of road in the State.

Mr. A. K. Vengu Ayyar.—That too is Devaswam *poramboke*.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—The extent of Devaswam *poramboke* is unknown, and the question will not be answered, because it refers to Devaswan as in the case of the adjournment motion of the other day. I am going to say that people won't work together.

President.—You are criticising some observations made by another Member with regard to the civilized Government without coming to the main point.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Now, Sir, in this country we obtain several things which is not obtained in civilized countries. Our civilisation is not complete.

Mr. K. T. Mathew.—If the Government is changed, what will be the situation?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I do not know when it will change. I leave this matter of ours being a civilized country. Sauce for the gander is sauce for the goose. Why not pass the amendment brought forward with regard to the Land Registration Bill, in order to make it more comprehensive? We get it in Malabar. We are more advanced, we say. But we are advised not to hasten, and some of the Members who spoke opposed me altogether. Why, Sir? Do not those conditions apply here? Can we not have the same thing as obtains in Malabar? Then Sir, there are the arguments based on municipalities. We have a municipality in Mattancheri, and only lately we had a lot of trouble over it. In Chittur and Tattamangalam they petitioned once that the municipality may be abolished. In Trichur the E. Ward people petitioned that they may be excluded from the municipal area. In Irinjalakkuda and Kunnamkulam the people opposed the introduction of minor municipalities. Sir, in municipal elections what all things have taken place? Were they not bristling with dissensions and communal quarrels? Are you going to work these hospitals with the men you have now who rightly or wrongly stand for communalism?

Mr. S. F. Nunez.—Abolish the Legislative Council also.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I don't go into further details. It has not been made out that a change is necessary. It has not been made out that the proposed change will make matters better. It is for the mover to explain.

Now, the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer is the man primarily in charge of the hospitals. Instead of that,we will have a Board. Where is the guarantee that the Board will spend money better? Is there a presumption that the Government will always be wrong, and that a non-official body will always be right? We cannot have such presumptions. They are matters to be proved to us as clearly as two and two make four, that, if these hospitals are taken from the hands of the present salaried men and placed in the hands of the Board, it will work better has not been made out, and until it is made out, no change should be contemplated. You may not be able to maintain discipline. It is easy for one man to maintain discipline than for a Board. Would not the honorary men run away, when they get a chance? Would they give an undertaking that they will work in the State for a certain number of years and would not depart in the meanwhile?

President.—If they go away, there are others to take their places.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Would it make for efficiency, if men change from day to day?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I will draw to the attention of the House that a lot of time has been taken by the Hon'ble Member. this rate this Bill is not going to end. I am very sorry, and at the same time I do not interrupt the Hon'ble Member. Most probably, we may be able to come to an agreement, and, therefore, it should be better for the Member to know that.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, it is the fault of the Member for Irinjalakkuda.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Every Member has a right to point out to the President that the time is over.

President.—He had asked for extra time. Mr. Ouseph, you have to condense your speech.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, I can foresee several difficulties in working the provisions of this Bill. I can foresee the difficulties in fixing the local areas and in assigning seats to the respective local authorities, the bitterness and confusion brought about by the election of the Board as in Municipal bodies, honorary men running about to canvass and cars carrying the units of the local authorities hither and thither. And I can also see an indifferent Board seldom taking interest in details and an all-powerful Secretary at whose gate I can see Hon'ble men with letters of recommendations or introductions each—man waiting and working hard for preference.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—A lot of time has been taken on this motion. I may tell you that, if this Bill is going to the Select Committee, necessary alterations may be made. I do not want the Hon'ble Member to speak at large, if he is not in agreement with the motion; and most probably, we may be able to come to an agreement in the Select Committee. Therefore, it would be better for the President to note the time.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—It is not my fault that I take so much time. It is the fault of the Member for Irinjalakkuda.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—A lot of time has been taken up by the Member. Every Member has a right to point out to the President that the time-limit has been over. That is why I drew your attention to it.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—Sir, I had requested you to give me some extra time.

President.—I think, Mr. Ouseph, you have to condense your speech.

Mr. C. A. Ouseph.—I have come to the end, Sir. We cannot have a policy different from those of our neighbours, and our neighbours in British India and the Striaits follow a different policy. There is an attractive policy. Whenever the honorary men get a chance, they may run away. They would

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

stick to it, it is said. Far from it. We are concerned with the life and death of persons. Therefore, we are to move slowly and carefully, but the present Bill is a revolutionary measure. For these reasons, Sir, I oppose the consideration of this Bill.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—Sir, I rise to support the principle of this Bill. I may also say that the Progressive Party which I have the honour to represent, would vote *en bloc* in support of the principles of the Bill. I desire to make it perfectly clear that neither I nor the party to which I belong fully approves of all the provisions of this Bill. There are many provisions to which we take exception, and there are many defects which have to be remedied. The House should consider the purport of the Bill in order to see whether the motion that the Bill be read in Council should be supported or not. S. O. 31 lays down that, if the motion be seconded, the principle of the Bill and the general provisions may then be discussed. If the motion be carried, the Secretary shall read the title of the Bill, etc. If the majority of the Members of this House vote that the Bill be read in Council, the Hon'ble Mover is going to ask for the appointment of a Select Committee. The principle involved is of far-reaching importance. Most Members have been objecting to the Objects and Reasons stated and to stray sections here and there. The bald statement of the Objects and Reasons of the Bill, and the scanty elucidations of the principles in the draft Bill are, I candidly admit, insufficient to bring home to the majority of the Members the purport and utility of this Bill. Now, 'the Objects and Reasons' does not form any part of a Bill. The principles of this Bill are to be found in the provisions embodied in these four chapters, and they deal with three matters of vital importance. The first being the improvement of the existing system of granting medical relief. The second is laid down in section 6, viz, the registration of medical practitioners. And the last is contained in section 19, that is to say—the licensing of chemists' shops:—no person shall vend or manufacture drugs without license—chemists' shops could not be run without licenses being obtained from the Government or some local authority. These are matters of very great importance. With regard to the registration of medical men, and the necessity for taking out licenses for vending and manufacturing drugs, I have referred to these points several times in this House. These are matters which could not be enforced in the State unless they are embodied in the Statute book. Resolutions, as the Member in charge of the Medical Department suggested yesterday, will not serve the purpose. Only by legislation could these be enforced. The Bill aims at curing these defects that

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

exist in the State at present. The introduction of the honorary system is the other principle dealt with. It was said that the proposed Bill received neither sympathy nor support from a very large section of people in Cochin, Travancore and British Malabar. I take exception to this statement. I can boldly assert that it has the entire sympathy of the general public. Now, the Bill has been published in the Gazette like the other Bills considered here. To my knowledge, not even a solitary petition objecting to the provisions of this Bill has reached the Government. With regard to the Land Registration Bill, there have been representations and petitions from all parts of the State, pointing out the undesirability of the proposed legislation. So far as I know, in regard to the Medical Relief Bill, there is not even a solitary representation against it, from anybody or any individual, to the Government. That certainly shows that public opinion is quite in favour of the Bill. Hon'ble Members might be in possession of the pamphlet in which the opinions of various newspapers are published. You will find them at pages 8 to 10 of this pamphlet. These newspapers are in favour of the Bill. Let us not misunderstand what is contained in the skeleton of the Bill, what we consider the vital principles in the Bill. We have had a very recent experience regarding the Nambudiri Kudumba Bill. The Bill, as brought, met with violent opposition, but the Bill as re-drafted by the Select Committee was found to be acceptable to the House which passed it by a large majority. Now. here is only a skeleton of the proposed Bill, which aims at improving the system of medical relief, management of medical institutions in the State and dealing with other medical matters to which I have referred. We are at the stage of allowing the Bill to go in for discussion later on. Now the main principle of this Bill only seeks to secure a larger measure of self-government; in the words of our beloved Maharaja "to associate people in an increasing measure in the administration of the departments"; to put it still more clearly, the governance of the Medical Department exclusively by paid officers of the State is sougt to be altered by the introduction of the voluntary system. This is a matter of vital importance to us. Being no medico, I have to depend very largely upon the body of expert medical opinion in the British Isles, for the latest pronouncements upon the subject in support of the plea. My friend, the Chief Medical Officer, stood up and said that opinion in British Isles and America is in favour of employing paid officers.

President.—Mr. Puduval, you are exceeding the time-limit. You are entitled to 10 minutes only.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—Our object is not to waste the time of this House. I may say for your information that the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Progressive party has accepted this as a party measure. After due consideration I am speaking as the mouthpiece of that party, and no other Member of the party would speak on the motion.

President.—In that case I shall allow you 10 minutes more.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—Now regarding this matter, Sir, Kingsley Wood, M. P., Parliamentary Secretary to the Ministry of Health, when opening the new buildings of the Prince Albert Convelascent Home at Worthing on the 12th February 1927, said " The Government stands firmly by the voluntary system, and would do everything they could to encourage voluntary organisations and hospitals. One of the best signs of the time is that during the last two years the voluntary hospitals have demonstrated their vitality and hold on the people of this country.

" *The Government's policy is wholly opposed to the creation of a State Medical Service.* It would not be in anybody's interest to take the work done by the medical practitioners of the country and put it in the hands of the whole time public servants. Nothing would be gained by such a course, and much would be lost. "(*The London Times Weekly Edition*, dated 17th February 1927.) That is the principle which we want to introduce in the Cochin State. The Department of Public Health in England is now manned entirely by paid officers and Lord Dawson, President of the Public Health Ministers' Consulting Council, expressed that the Government was pursuing a wrong policy in managing hospitals by paid officers of the State, and that it was desirable that the voluntary system should be adopted. The "voluntary system" and the "honorary system" are synonymous; both mean the same thing.

Then, again, Lord Dawson, President of the Public Health Ministers' Consulting Council, says:—

"Preventive and curative medicines could not be separated on any sound principle, and they must both be brought within the sphere of the General Practitioner whose duties should embrace the work of communal as well as individual medicine.

"The basis of the whole scheme is the "Voluntary System". Patients retain all their rights of free choice of doctor. Doctors retain all their freedom of action. *The State provides the fabric.* It should not interfere unduly with the work or liberty of the personnel." Now, I ask, is there anything in this Bill which is repugnant to the expert opinion that I have placed before the House? Let us hasten slowly; the Government has got the disposal of the money. According to the Diwan's pronouncement reported in Volume I in the inaugural session, "The vital administration will be practically in your hands". That is the injunction to

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

the Members in this House at the inaugural session. "Let me also remind you that the disposal of money is in your hands". The mover has pointed out that the object is to work the Medical Department in a more satisfactory manner. The Chief Medical Officer, and my Hon'ble friends, the Members for Mulakunnattukavu and Chalakkudi, say that the Medical Department is perfectly well managed. This observation is entirely beside the point. The question is, have we attained perfection in that line? Even in England they want more voluntary workers. The Medical Department discharges two functions, the first being medication and surgery, and the second the management of the instutitions. We have been contributing a large slice of Sate Revenue for the administration of the Medical Department. We have to see, if the technical portion of the work and the administrative portion of it could be improved and carried on on better lines. That is the point before us. We cast no reflections upon the department. The department may or may not be well managed. Improvements are most desirable and urgently needed, and it is in that view we wish to approach this question. We do not want any of the existing officers of the department to be interfered with in any way, for the system can come into full operation only after 12 or 15 years. In the meanwhile, we gradually work up this ideal as set out by Lord Dawson. The idea of introducing non-official members into the Board of Management and into the personnel of the department is a very desirable one. We have to see what percentage should be maintained of paid officers. The provisions of the Bill distinctly show that we do not want to send away paid officers. Section 18 distinctly says "All the paid staff shall be appointed by the Board, but appointments to offices carrying a salary of more than Rs. 50, shall be subject to the approval of the Government; so that there will be a number of paid officers, and there will be honorary workers also doing honorary works, and trying to improve themselves. What should be the proportion of paid officers to voluntary workers is a matter of detail, and we get the services of non-officials without any remuneration whatever. They, on their part, learn from experience in the hospital, and they could be sent out and posted in the rural dispensaries. It is a confusion of thought to think that this Bill is intended for the amelioration of the lot of qualified medical practitioners who are not in the service. It is not so at all. I would not have urged anything in support of the Bill, if it were so. That is only a result following from the enforcement of the Bill. I may also say that in matters concerning the life and

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

death of people the existence of an efficient and competent body of medical practitioners is a well-known asset to the State. Under existing conditions the allotment now made to give medical relief to those who stand in need of it is insufficient. Is it desirable to have in our hospitals incompetent and inefficient men to administer medicine and treat the patients who go there? Government officers, by remaining in office for a very long time, unfortunately, contract a sort of official myopia which blurs and distorts mental vision. They seem to imagine that the capacity to do efficient work is the monopoly of Government servants, and that non-officials could not properly manage any public concern. This view is quite erroneous. In the spirit of the speech delivered by His Highness the Maharaja "we want the people to be associated in an increasing measure in the governance of the various departments." Popularisation and democratisation are feasible and desirable in the Medical Department. Why non-official Members also should object to it, why they should oppose the introduction of the voluntary system into the work of the department, to secure management of hospitals by officials and non-officials combined, is beyond my understanding. I submit there is no substance in the opposing speech of the Chief Medical Officer. His vehement attack affected but the fringes of the question. Let me repeat that the question before the House is whether the Bill should be read in Council. Were it to pass this reading, the Select Committee would collect all information available and submit its report. In the discussion at the next stage of the Bill, the House may come to any conclusion it thinks proper. It would be improper to avoid a consideration of the subject in all its bearings. In the light of these facts I would request the House to vote for the motion.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—In the beginning of this discussion, I never thought of making a speech upon this Bill. But now I do not feel any heaviness in my heart or giddiness in my brain to stand up and say that this legislation is useful. I have got one more advantage that I do not belong to the so-called Progressive Party.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Why the "so-called Progressive Party"?

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—For the moment it is only in name. First of all, I do not at all sympathise with the existing system of medical treatment in hospitals. In my opinion it is an absolute waste of money. I shall explain myself. From the Chief Medical Officer's statement yesterday, it is seen that 400 patients are examined and prescribed within the course

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

of two hours. How many minutes could you allot for each patient—as it is, you cannot allot even a minute or 30 seconds—if, in the meantime, the name of the patient, his caste, his father's name and his age are also to be written? As soon as a patient comes there and says " my stomach ", the Doctor asks "what is your name "? He is not allowed to proceed further. Then the Doctor asks his father's name, age, etc. He writes out something, and gives it to the patient. It is clear that they have no time to prescribe. Now, coming to the compounders, there are only a few of them. Many coloured bottles are kept there, and bottles after bottles are sent out. The names, etc., are noted down for the purpose of statistics.

President.— The remedy is to appoint more doctors and more compounders.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I am coming to that. If they do not write these things down, how can the Chief Medical Officer bring forward these statistics before this House to show that the number of patients have increased. We do not know from these statistics whether any of the patients died as soon as they went out of the Hospital; whether any of them were cured by these bottles—that is my question. Their definition of a very successful operation is that the patient should die only after he is removed from the operation theatre. The methods of surgery that are followed as per the Allopathic system may be necessary. Unfortunately, that is a necessary evil. According to the present administration as well as of the present day civilisation, we are not satisfied with Vittala Shenoi's *kadukka*. We must all go to England for all these medicines of these coloured waters.

President.—You must also qualify in England.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I am not at all in sympathy with the existing system of treatment and the medicine itself. It is, I think, a necessary evil for sometime at least to come. One remedy for this is that, if honorary surgeons and physicians are appointed in the hospitals, some more time could be given to these patients by the doctors for prescribing, at least one minute or two minutes. They are also not to be paid any remuneration, nor can our State afford to spend more on this account. I agree with that portion of this Bill, and so I support it. They will be improving their practice, if these private practitioners are allowed to work in the hospitals, because they get a number of patients on whom they can try their experiments in the hospitals, which, as is said, will improve their private practice. Now, the introduction of the honorary system will be very useful to the general public.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

With regard to this principle in the Bill, I perfectly agree with the mover, and it is high time especially that the Cochin Darbar should introduce the honorary system, because we cannot afford to pay more men. There is absolute necessity, according to the statement given by the Chief Medical Officer as to how the number of patients is increasing in large numbers. So, if you want to do something towards these poor people, you will have to appoint more men. I had once the opportunity of inspecting the Ernakulam General Hospital with the Chief Medical Officer. It is like a bazaar. About 100 or 120 people running hither and thither and standing in a group around one man. What can one single man do to all these people? There were people belonging to all castes—Christian, Muhammadan, Jew, Nayar, Brahmin, etc. There were people suffering from stomach ache, eye disease, and all sorts of diseases. The doctor was steadily going on with his prescriptions, noting down the name, caste, father's name and all those particulars. If the honorary doctors are also appointed, there would be some relief to the paid man, and the poor people would also be benefited.

President.—As regards the honorary system, there was not much controversy.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I support the motion on that account alone. But, as regards the management by a Board, I am absolutely against it.

President.—So you are against a Board managing the affairs of the hospitals?

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—I have absolutely no faith in these Boards. They will not be able to undertake the management, even though the Board were to consist of honest and enthusiastic men.

President.—You know what assurance the Chief Medical Officer has to give in regard to the taking of honorary surgeons.

Mr. M. Krishna Menon.—Even for that assurance, some sort of legislation will be necessary, so that it may be an inducement to the Chief Medical Officer to take the honorary surgeons into the hospitals. After all, we are human beings, and we are all, more or less, one, so far as the purse is concerned. Naturally, it is not one's own fault. We are all human beings. They will be rather reluctant to take in honorary men, for by that they will have to share some of their private practice with the honorary man. So they will be slow in acting up to the assurance. If there is legislation or a regulation compelling them to appoint such and such honorary officers, they will have to appoint honorary men;

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

for, if they do not do so, questions will be coming in, "how many honorary men were entertained", "how many of them are Christians," " how many of them are Nayars", "how many of them are Brahmins", and so on. They will be asked to place statements on the table regarding these matters. So the medical authorities will be compelled to take some action, if a regulation is passed, and it will be an inducement for the men in authority to go a step further. With these few remarks, I sit down.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Mr. President, it is now nearly two o'clock, and so I may be allowed a little more time to answer certain of the points raised by the Medical Officer representing the Government. Well, I concede most heartily the spirit and the method of his speech; I appreciate it as one of the best speeches I have heard in this Hall. I am bound to confess that certain of the statements that have been made by the Chief Medical Officer require correction at my hands.

Before dealing with the Chief Medical Officer's speech within the limited time, I shall confine myself to the answering of some of the observations that have fallen yesterday from the lips of the most learned Member that this House can boast of—I mean the Member for Mulakunnattukavu. He has been good enough to assure us that he has been in touch with the various institutions for the last forty years, and I am very glad that he has been taking considerable pains to be in touch with those institutions. But it is wonderful that he should find it necessary of his own accord, without listening to the arguments, without understanding the provisions of the Bill, to come forward before this House and enter into an emphatic and vehement opposition against this Bill, as though he is anxious to gain the title of official opposer of all the democratic measures in this House. While I can understand the Chief Medical Officer's argument and also the spirit of it, I find great difficulty, in restraining myself in speaking in measured terms about the attitude of the Member for Mulakunnattukavu and the wild attacks delivered upon the private medical practitioners. I tell you frankly, so long as you confine your attack upon me, I shall not retaliate, but that, if anybody goes out of his way to retaliate on others, I shall show no consideration whatsoever. He has been telling us that a set of ignorant men are going about asking for the legislation, and I ask the Hon'ble Member whether he has ever had occasion to call in the service of a private medical practitioner to his own son's bedside. It is one thing, Sir, to show your appreciation of people, but it is another thing to go out of your way to attack people, as he has done yesterday! He has said

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

this yesterday, and, further, all this he has said without understanding what the arguments that I developed to prove that this Bill ought not to be opposed. And the reason assigned was that there were four sentences at the beginning of the Bill, and he based his whole arguments upon those sentences without studying the objects of the Bill, and without understanding properly that it is a dangerous thing to have a little knowledge. I think it is also equally true that it is a dangerous thing to have too much knowledge. There are certain people who think—because—as they think—all the facts and statistics of all the governments in this world are in their pockets—they are competent to sit in judgment upon other people, upon every subject and any subject whatsoever. Now, Sir, when you eat too much, you feel the difficulty to digest; that is a sign of distress; and it is a sign of madness. The same is the case with knowledge. People grasp, grasp and swallow without giving adequate time to digest; they feel uncomfortable. I think it was in this condition that I found out yesterday the ways and arguments of the Hon'ble Member for Mulakunnattukavu.

Now, Sir, in this Bill there are two means proposed. The House will note that, I say, very carefully. The first means is the honorary system, and I shall tell you candidly that it was a great surprise to me to find the attitude adopted by the Government. I confess to you that I accepted the united decision from that side, and it was a pleasant surprise that the Government were willing to study this question and to understand and appreciate the arguments advanced. But though that principle has been accepted in the speech delivered by the Chief Medical Officer, he was made to speak as though the Government were going to refuse.

The House rose for lunch, it being past 2 p. m. It reassembled at 3 p. m., the Diwan presiding.

President.—Now, we shall resume our discussion.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, the only Member who opposed the very principle of this Bill is the Member for Chalakkudi. All the others, while accepting the principle of this Bill, have had their own view about the managing committee's business, and their opposition centred round that single point. But it was reserved for the Member for Chalakkudi to attack the very principle which, of all the persons, he was most pronouncedly inclined to in the Special Finance Committee. Sir, it will be a waste of time to place arguments before a hollow people who swallow their principles. Therefore, I shall not undertake the impossible task of answering the points raised by him, but shall straightway enter into the merits of the question, and say a few

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

words in reply to the Member, who represents the Government side

Sir, the great complaint against me was that I confined myself to one aspect of the question. What is the principle of this Bill? At the first reading of this Bill, as I understood it, we were to discuss only the principle, and the basic principle of this Bill is the replacement of the paid system gradually, without affecting the interests of those already in the service, by a system of voluntary work. There is another reason why I did not touch on the management. I have no objection to confess to this Council that we ourselves were not agreed upon that one principle. While we are unitedly in favour of this principle of voluntary system among us, there is a wide difference of opinion as to what extent the power now held by the Government should be delegated to the committee. Now, Sir, once you accept the principle, the method by which that principle should be introduced is a matter of secondary importance to my mind. The whole argument of the Chief Medical Officer centred round the appinting of a committee and the inadvisability of tampering with a system which, when all is said and done, has served our people well for a long time. I am willing to concede all those points that have been raised by him, but in a matter like this, when we enunciate a principle, you can very well understand that in a Council like this it will be impossible to go into detail about any of the clauses of this Bill, nor am I expected to do so. What was that clause, Sir? It was said that, out of 10 people, at least not less than half, i. e., 5 should be nominated by the Government themselves. Only one member should be nominated from the medical profession. That leaves you four, and in the scheme of things which I would have developed here, if I had occasion to do so, I reserve those seats to 4 men in Trichur. One is the Municipal Chairman, one is the Bishop, one is the Principal of the College and one the Government may choose to appoint. Now, I ask this Council, "do you mean to tell me that a committee, constituted as I have just now ventured to place before you, is likely to show any irresponsibility? If it is your view that, because it is Government fund, it must be administered by a body of Government officers, then my submission is you must abolish your Municipality to-morrow; the British Government must abolish their Taluk Boards and District Boards. What is the Municipality, Sir? The Municipal authorities are empowered by the Government to collect revenue from the people. Because of this power invested in them by the Government, they constitute a kind of self-governing institution in nearly four places in our State. If

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

our people are capable of managing a matter of a lakh of rupees—a government involving various departments as the Municipal administration is—do you come forward and say to my very face that a committee of 10 men are incompetent to administer a matter concerning a paltry sum of 25 or 30 thousand rupees in a place like Trichur—I believe that is the sum granted to the institution? When the Government came forward, mind you, had it objected to the principle of this Bill, I would not have felt so much; but you are objecting to the method of introducing that principle. Is it fair to ask me to explain all this in detail, all the points raised by you in open Council? Should you not give me a chance in the Committee stage to explain to you the various processes so that all the objections that you may offer, I shall be able to meet? No such privilege has been extended to me. I remember many Bills have been given that chance in this House. Though there has been a difference of opinion, I want the Government to consider that, in spite of all that, my attitude in this Council is not in direct opposition to that of the Government. I have never considered myself, sitting on the opposition bench always, to be criticising the Government.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—It is not the opposition bench; it is only a progressive one.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I say I have never considered that the function of any party in Council constituted like ours is simply to offer uninterrupted, merciless opposition to the Government. You may ask, "What is the worth of your opposition?" Well gentlemen, that way lies danger. Our opposition will have some value, and you would feel the weight of it. Do not take it that I am saying it in a threatening spirit. It is for knowing it in a proper way so that we may understand where we stand, because understanding will create appreciation of the different standpoints, and appreciation of the standpoints is conducive to friendly working in this Council.

President.—Mutual co-operation is also required.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Exactly, Sir.

Now, I entirely appreciate the difficulties that face the Government. I have no complaints against the Chief Medical Officer. This House must consider that the Medical Officer, and I represent this case as two lawyers and not as two judges. (*Hear hear*). You will be guiding yourselves safely, if you consider that the Chief Medical Officer represents the case from the one side, and I represent it from the other side. Please think so. Then weigh the evidence, and if you are satisfied with this Bill, the principle which I repeate, you have

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

accepted to-day, if you consider that a Bill of this nature which has given me enormous trouble and difficulties—difficulties which you do not understand and you will not realise—I say, if you think like that, and if you think that I am a little sincere in a matter like this, I ask you whether, simply because you have to-day a number of men against me, you are also going to vote against me. Should I not repeat it to-morrow ? That is the point you have to consider.

Now, if you appoint a committee—let the Chief Medical Officer do it—whatever be the recommendations of that Committee—I speak of the terms of the Bill—I shall wholeheartedly accept all those principles. As I said, this is the beginning, and we do not want the Government to rush forward, nor do we expect the Government to do so. As I said just now, this clause has created such dissension among us, one portion of our party holding that I have given more power to the Government, and then the others saying that we shall have no conscientious objection to vote because of this clause. In a circumstance like this the mover can place the thing as it is till he gets a chance to restrict and modify this clause, and I say deliberately, freely and with no restriction whatsoever, whatever additions you may attach to that clause, whatever changes you are going to make shall be acceptable to us. If you constitute an advisory committee with no executive power, but power to enquire into and report to the Chief Medical Officer, a committee which has power to represent the grievance of the public to the authorities concerned, personally, I am satisfied.

Then, Sir, there is one point I used to hear very often here, "This is Government money ; you have no business to know", and so on. Now, it is a very wrong conception. Government money belongs as much to you as to me. We all contribute to the Government treasury, and, for the time being, you are called upon by His Highness the Maharaja to execute the Government and to carry on the Government and to utilise the money properly and for the benefit of the people.

President.—I do not like your speaking like this. We are working for the benefit of the people.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—We have understood it correctly. We are all glad to hear that expression of yours.

President.—It is an undisputed proposition.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I fully realise that the officials are responsible for the proper disbursement of the public money. I can understand that. But you sometimes speak as though we are a gang of *poachers* entering into the private preserve of

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

some people, as though we are foreigners invading into the Cochin territory. That is not consistent with either *your* dignity or with *our* self-respect.

President.—Nobody said such a thing.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Yes, Sir.

President.—Those expressions, if you scrutinise, have no justification. To say that you are considered as *poachers* in a discussion in the Council !

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I drop that, Sir. If it is an unparliamentary expression, I shall withdraw it. I have no objection.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Nobody said that it is unparliamentary.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—If you consider ; that is all.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We do not consider it like that.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Now, in a well-ordered country, you will never hear this statement—Government's money is people's money. You have no right to say "This is Government money." Day before yesterday, the Revenue Member interrupted one of the speakers and observed that it is a mistake to think that the Government is different from the people. The Government is not different from the people. Government money is people's money . If it is so, I submit we have as much right to offer our suggestions as any of you, gentlemen, sitting on the other side. The great difference in these things is this. As the learned Medical Officer observed, all these hospitals are in other countries run by public contributions. A Government hospital means one maintained by public contribution on a large scale. That is the difference between the two. As I said, there are great difficulties. We are willing to accept anything reasonable, but, on the other hand, if you want to defeat this— I know how the vote will be—we will be wanting in one or two votes, no doubt.—

President.—Please don't speak about votes.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Please don't interrupt me. Please excuse me. To the best of my ability, let me put this in the proper way. If you say that anything is unparliamentary, I shall withdraw.

I also want to tell the House that, if such a spirit were once instilled in this Hall, believe me, it will be a long time before that spirit will go out of this Hall. Let us understand each other. Let us know how we stand. We are willing to yield almost anything the Government demand, and in spite of all that, if, with a majority of votes, you are going to defeat us, then, we

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

shall also claim the same privilege hereafter in our dealings with you.

President.—I do not understand all these things; i. e., about votes, and all that. What is the consequence of that I cannot realise.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Sir, I always understand you as the President, and I am addressing an abstract thing as "the Government." I am making these observations to whomsoever it may be—I say that on our part we are prepared to give way, and we are requesting the other people to do what they can. If you take objection, I have no objection to withdraw.

Now, Sir, I want only one more observation to make, and then I shall have finished.

The reason why I alone take this attitude I shall tell you. I have got a very grave responsibility, an added responsibility on my shoulders which would also be for the sake of my colleagues. In this connection, I am representing a body of men for the time being. However incompetent I may be, I have been called upon to represent a body of men whose interests I have pleaded befor you yesterday and to-day, and I think any action of mine in that intolerant spirit by simply putting a question to the extreme opposition is not consistent with the interests of those whom I represent. I have, therefore, placed the whole matter in the hands of the Government, and I honestly think that by the Government's showing a little consideration, we can achieve a result which would be satisfactory to all concerned. Let not the Government think that we are simply adopting these tactics to give further trouble. Remove any clause you like, I repeat, and make any modification you like, have your own committee, appoint your own men, we will not ask you to appoint a single man or to make a single modification. Can I go further than this? I place the whole matter before the House.

President.—If you want to exercise the right of reply, you may do it, Dr. Verghese.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Sir, yesterday, when I made my observations on the merits of this Bill, and made a survey of "the Objects and Reasons", I said that it would appear that this Bill proclaimed itself to be the panacea for all evils in the Medical Department. It was said, if you want to safeguard the interests of the poor, employ honorary doctors; if you want economy and not to waste public funds, employ honorary doctors; if you want efficiency in your medical men, employ honorary doctors. But when these objects and reasons were dissected and laid bare by the inexorable tests of fact and reason, they,

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

like Dead Sea apples, when handled, crumbled to dust and ashes. When the citadel was about to fall, the Member for Trichur with a forensic adroitness and legal agility in which he is a well-known adept comes to the rescue and says that "the Objects and Reasons" do not form any part of the Bill. With foundation gone, is there any superstructure? Now, who will come forward and press the Bill? I say the Bill has no standing, if the objects and reasons arrayed in the draft are now disowned either by the mover or by his important supporters.

Passing on to the speech of the Hon'ble Member for Trichur, I notice that absence of representation from the public has been taken by him to be the great sin of the mass of the people of Cochin. I say the people of Cochin have so much faith in the sanity and soundness of the Government and their solicitude for the welfare of its subjects that they repose greater faith in their Government than in the hands of this Legislative Council. I say that it would appear that they must have realised that this Bill is the outcome of unpractical enthusiasm for Utopian ideals. The Hon'ble Member who moved this Bill, however, has insisted that the principle of this Bill is the honorary system. But I have taken pains to prove yesterday that the honorary system adumbrated in this Bill and the honorary or voluntary system which prevails in England are opposed in their principles. In one place, i. e., England, there are voluntary hospitals for which money is raised by the people. Although Government money is certainly people's money, the one is collected by law and the other is by voluntary payment—subscriptions, endowments bequests, made by charitable and philanthropic people and not extracted by law as Government money. That is the kind of voluntary system. But let not this House be under the idea that all hospitals of England are all voluntary. The major part of the hospitals for infectious diseases are all run by highly paid Medical Officers. There the Western System of Medicine is the only system of medicine prevalent, and Government money is not enough to supply the necessary medical institutions for the relief of the inhabitants of the place. For that very reason it is that charitable and public men who care for the welfare of the poor have really and rightly contributed their money for establishing institutions for the relief of the sick. I have also proved yesterday that the prerequisite of the honorary system is the existence of a body of medical practitioners here who can take the place of the Government officers, and I said that it is that basic principle which is absent or does not exist to an adequate degree in the Cochin State. Therefore, the Bill has really no standing now. It may be that the honorary system may

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

come to be introduced here, as it is recognised that it is necessary to give all the help that the Government can for the raising up of an independent medical service in the country. Because the Government has recognised that from their own funds they are unable to meet all the wants of the population, the Government is anxious to see a body of independent medical practitioners rising up to fill and take their place and give the necessary medical relief.

The question of again legalising the levy of fees in hospitals is a dangerous system, and is liable to gross abuses. The Government must take cognisance not only of men of high principles and generous hearts like the Hon'ble mover of this Bill but also of people with mercenary motives and character of a doubtful nature.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.— On a point of information, Sir. May I know whether this is the view of the Government, that money should not be realised from rich persons? May I know whether the Hon'ble Member for the Government is opposed to levying money from such persons?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.— I am opposed to the legalisation, i. e., passing of any such law in this House and giving of unlawful freedom for the levy of fees.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—May I know whether it is the Government's view or the Member's personal view?

President.—You may take it as the view of the Government Member now. For the time being, it is his personal observation.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Where paying wards were constructed, as they are done in other Government hospitals, in Madras and other places, the Government have already laid down certain rules for the levy of fees. If that is all that is wanted, I said the Government would concede that the employment of honorary doctors would meet the sympathy which it deserves from the Government, and further, after the paying wards are constructed—which it is the purpose of the Government to do at no distant date—rules regarding the levy of fees for patients who are able to pay will also be laid down. For that, is it necessary to introduce a Bill? The Government is prepared to do all that.

Now, the analogy of the Municipality has also been made by the Hon'ble Member who introduced this Bill. There is no analogy. That is the unit of a self-governing body constituted under legal regulations. They have got power to raise their funds apart from the Government money, and they are spending money which they have raised from the people.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

President.—Subject to the sanction of the Government.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Yes, the control of the Government. This is money collected for the general administration of the State and not for a particular purpose as in the case of the Municipality, for their special object is the making of provision for the sick and the poor and the sanitation of that locality. Therefore, I say the analogy does not stand.

The Hon'ble Member for Trichur quoted some quotations from somewhere—Ido not exactly know from where—the validity of which I am not going to question. But let me remind him that the voluntary hospital of which he is speaking is not the voluntary hospital adumbrated in this Bill, and the Government policy is against the introduction of the same in the State medical service. Yes. We are going to extend the right hand of fellowship to independent medical practitioners, and with that solicitude it is, no less than the solicitude for the welfare of the population in the rural parts, that the Government has recently established rural dispensaries in a few small stations. But there also objection has been raised by the Hon'ble Member that the dispensary was located in an out-of-the-way place like Kuthiran and Pattikkad. That particular place was recommended to the Government at the instance of a largely signed petition from the people of that place where I knew personally that malaria was prevailing.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I beg leave to correct the statement of my Hon'ble friend. What I said was that the medical men have been reduced to such a pititable condition that they are willing to accept posts on a petty pay of Rs. 30 in such rural and malarial parts as Kuthiran and Pattikkad. That is what I said. There were ten applicants for the post.

President.—His objection was not to the location of the dispensaries. It was only to draw your attention to the pitiable condition of the medical practitioners.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have already admitted that nearly everyone in this House, Members of both sides, are keenly alive to the distress and want of employment among the medical practitioners and raw graduates of our Universities, and Government cannot undertake to find employment for all, but they have the sympathy—I may assure this House—to do all that the Government can to back them, and it is with this object that I said that there would be no objection to employ honorary doctors in some selected hospitals in the State.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Besides giving employment, we want the Government to do many other things by which these learned men would be employed.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—As I have said before, the crux of this Bill does not consist in the employment of honorary doctors but the complete transferance of the control and management of the Government institutions which are now functioning in a most efficient manner to the hands of a set of amateurs. What is the object? What is the necessity? No necessity has been made out except to practice the art of self-government. The practice of the art of self-government should be begun in Panchayats. Begin there. Democratization at the very top is not sound policy. If you want to build up a self-governing institution, begin at the bottom.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—I never said that.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Some one said that.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I say medicine is one of the bottom departments.

President.—Anyhow, there was some discussion on the matter.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Finally, I notice that, as the Hon'ble Member for Trichur shifted his position, the Hon'ble the mover of the Bill has also shifted his position as regards the governing body, and says there is no objection to an advisory body.

Dr. A. R. Menon.—Whatever position the Government may bring forward, I am willing to accept.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—If it is only an advisory body, legislation is meaningless. All these things can be done by an executive order. If the Hon'ble Member would now withdraw the Bill with the consent of his party, I may say that an assurance may be given regarding not only the employment of honorary doctors but also the appointment of an advisory body.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Is this the Medical Officer's personal view or the Government view?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I will be able to explain that. This has so suddenly sprung upon me that I have not been able to consult the Government. I may, for the information of the House, read out a Government order which has been recently promulgated by the Government of Madras. There, in the large Government Head-quarter Hospitals of each District, an Advisory Committee is constituted in order to keep the Surgeon-General and the Government informed as to the needs of the hospital as viewed by the public. The entire supervision and management of the institution and its establishment will be in the hands of the District Medical and Sanitary Officer subject to the control of the Surgeon-General, and the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Committee shall be an advisory body with no executive authority, and there are rules with regard to that. I am sure that the system which has been introduced in the Madras hospitals will not be discountenanced by our Government, if the Members on the opposite side will now withdraw the Bill from the House.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Is it the opinion of the Hon'ble Member?

President.—Is it open to the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to hold out an assurance without the order of the Government? Perhaps, he means he will do his best.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—Is it a personal statement or official statement?

President.—He said he had no opportunity to consult the Government. So it is a personal statement, and he would do his best.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—The Member says that he will press the point upon the Government, but that is not the Government view.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—As I told you, this modified request was sprung upon me here in this House just now, and I had no opportunity to consult the Diwan; but I hope that an institution which has been introduced in the Madras hospitals will not be discountenanced by our Government, and I hope our Government may introduce it here. That is all that I have said.

Mr. A. Sankara Puduval.—The Hon'ble Member holds out a pious hope.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The Hon'ble Member remarked that I have lately sent up recommendations amounting to the grant of a lakh of rupees for the improvements of this hospital, as if all these could be avoided under the honorary system. It is for the construction of paying wards and certain other most essential improvements which are necessary for the progress of the hospital.

President.—It is time to put the motion to the vote of the House. Before actually doing so, I wish to give expression to my sincere appreciation in regard to the manner in which the debate of this highly controversial measure was carried on in this House (*Hear, hear*). We have had a very lively debate, both yesterday afternoon and to-day, and we have had an excellent set of speeches, so much so that I do not think I remember having heard such speeches, admirable in their tune and manner, as I had occasion to hear both yesterday and to-day, and the spirit in which the discussion was carried on was also free from all objections. There was no personal rancour or ill-will or malice in the discussions. The attempt of the Members was only to

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

put forward all the aspects of the case in a thorough manner, and my thanks are due to them. They kept their temper exceedingly well. I was ever anticipating whether they would give themselves up to feelings and emotions, so that they would forget themselves and indulge in objectionable expressions. Nothing of the kind happened, and I sincerely thank all the Members for the excellent manner in which the discussion was carried on. One thing I wish to say finally, and that is "Be pleased to remember that, whatever may be the nature of the votes that are given in this Council on this important Bill—no doubt, it is a party Bill, and there has been Government opposition also—in whatever way the division falls, whether the mover and his party succeed or the Government succeed, be pleased to note that we would not carry any ill-will or spite on that account". The successes and defeats in this Council must always be taken in a sportsmanlike spirit (*Hear, hear*), and then you see if the Government loses, we are one with you hereafter, and if you lose, you must be one with the Government. In that spirit this division will be carried as divisions on all subjects. If these fundamental principles are borne in mind, our Council will show a fine record of useful work during the period of its existence. It is now my duty to put the motion to the vote of the House.

The motion was put to the vote, 18 voting for, 18 against and one neutral.

Dr. A. G. Menon.—I want a poll, Sir.

A poll was taken with the following result:—

For.	*Against.*
1. Mr. Chakko Cheruvattur	1. Mr. C. Achyuta Menon
2. ,, A. Eachara Menon	2. ,, K. Achyuta Menon
3. Dr. A. G. Menon	3. ,, V. K. Aravindaksha Menon
4. Mr. E. Ikkanda Wariar	4. ,, O. R. Chummar
5. ,, C. N. Ittiravi Nambudiri	5. ,, K. Govinda Menon
6. ,, C. A. Kunjunni Raja	6. ,, K. P. Karuppan
7. Srimati T. Madhavi Amma	7. Rao Sahib Mr. T. V. Kasturi Ranga Ayyar
8. Mr. K. T. Mathew	8. Mr. V. K. Kochunni Menon
9. ,, P. Munda Vaidyan	9. ,, S. S. Koder
10. ,, S. F. Nunez	10. ,, T. K. Krishna Menon
11. ,, N. Padmanabha Menon	11. ,, K. Krishna Pisharoti
12. ,, K. S. Rama Ayyar	12. ,, C. Matthai
13. ,, T. A. Ramachandra Ayyar	13. ,, C. A. Ouseph
14. ,, M. K. Raman	14. ,, I. Raman Menon
15. Dr. A. R. Menon	15. ,, Sheik Abdul Qadir Sahib Bahadur
16. Mr. A. B. Salem	16. ,, V. B. Vaidyanatha Ayyar
17. ,, A. Sankara Puduval	17. ,, A. K. Vengu Ayyar
18. ,, K. Sankaran Nambudiri	18. Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly